

The former Overseas Development Administration (ODA) became the Department for International Development (DFID) in May 1997. References in this report to the ODA apply to events and actions prior to this change.

The opinions expressed in this study are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the views of the Department for International Development.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### VOLUME I

Preface	i
Foreword	iii
List of Abbreviations & Acronyms	v
Figure 1 Montserrat at the end of 1998 and a chronology of volcanic events and evacuations	ix
Figure 2 Bramble Airport and the Volcano, November 1998	x
<b>SUMMARY OF MAIN FINDINGS AND KEY LESSONS</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1. INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>2. THE SOUFRIÈRE HILLS ERUPTION SINCE 1995 AND ITS IMPACT</b>	<b>15</b>
2.1 Background	15
2.2 The eruption of the Soufrière Hills Volcano	15
2.3 Impacts of the volcano	16
<b>3. HMG'S RESPONSE: JULY 1995 - OCTOBER 1998</b>	<b>19</b>
3.1 Introduction	19
3.2 Initial crisis: July-September 1995	20
3.3 Waiting on the volcano: September 1995-June 1997	20
3.4 Volcanic crisis: June-September 1997	21
3.5 Moving from emergency to reconstruction and sustainable development	22
3.6 Resources	23
3.7 The components of HMG's response	23
<b>4. RISK MANAGEMENT: SCIENTIFIC MONITORING AND PROTECTING LIVES AND HEALTH</b>	<b>25</b>
4.1 A reactive strategy	25
4.2 Disaster preparedness	25
4.3 Scientific monitoring and risk assessment	26
4.4 Building science into emergency policy	29
4.5 Protecting lives: emergency planning and operations	29
4.6 Safeguarding public health	31
<b>5. SOCIAL SECTORS: ACCOMMODATION, FOOD VOUCHERS AND EDUCATION</b>	<b>33</b>
5.1 Accommodation	33
5.2 Public shelter for displaced people	33
5.3 Emergency housing	34
5.4 The social safety net: from relief rations to income support	36
5.5 Education	36

<b>6. EMERGENCY INVESTMENT AND ENGINEERING PROGRAMMES</b>	<b>39</b>
6.1 Introduction	39
6.2 Timing and appropriateness	40
6.3 Costs and cost effectiveness	42
6.4 Emergency or development investment?	42
6.5 Institutional and management aspects	44
 <b>7. RESPONDING TO THE ECONOMIC AND FINANCIAL CONSEQUENCES OF THE VOLCANIC EMERGENCY</b>	 <b>45</b>
7.1 Introduction	45
7.2 Economic development strategies	45
7.3 The private sector	46
7.4 Budgetary assistance	46
7.5 The financial sector	47
 <b>8. MANAGING THE EMERGENCY IN MONTserrat, BARBADOS AND LONDON</b>	 <b>49</b>
8.1 Introduction	49
8.2 HMG's changing management arrangements and the shifting locus of responsibility	49
8.3 The Government of Montserrat's role	50
8.4 Emergency or development aid?	51
8.5 Assessment of management performance	51
 <b>9. CONCLUSIONS AND LESSONS</b>	 <b>53</b>
A. An achievement for Montserratians and a qualified success for HMG	53
B. HMG's performance: criteria for emergency assessment	56
C. Natural disaster emergency management: some lessons from HMG's response	65
D. Monitoring the volcano: risk assessment and volcano-seismic crisis management	69
 <b>List of Appendices</b>	
A: Terms of reference	71
B: Key events of the Montserrat volcanic emergency and a volcanological note on the Soufrière Hills Volcano eruption 1995-1999	73
C: List of people contacted	79
D: The evaluation team: biographical note	85

### List of Figures

Figure 1.	Montserrat at the end of 1998 and a chronology of volcanic events and evacuations	ix
Figure 2.	Bramble Airport and the Volcano, November 1998	x
Figure 3.	Montserrat volcanic emergency structure: HMG management structure	18
Figure 4.	Selected risk maps produced by the MVO	28
Figure 5.	Public Housing: housing types, access roads and an abandoned school bus - November 1998	38
Figure 6.	Emergency Jetty at Little Bay - November 1998	41
Figure 7.	Temporary Government Headquarters at Brades - November 1998	43

### List of Tables

Table 5.1:	Educational provision in Montserrat, June 1995-September 1998	37
Table 6.1:	Selected emergency investment programmes - general status	39
Table 6.2:	Time Taken in processing emergency projects (in months)	40

## VOLUME II

List of Abbreviations & Acronyms	i
Maps	v

<b>1. THE SOUFRIERE HILLS ERUPTION SINCE 1995 AND ITS PHYSICAL AND DEMOGRAPHIC IMPACT</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Eruption of the Soufriere Hills Volcano	1
1.2 Physical environmental impacts	6
1.3 Demography of the crisis	7
<b>2. HMG'S RESPONSE: JULY 1995-OCTOBER 1998</b>	<b>11</b>
2.1 Catching up with the volcano	11
2.2 Organisational arrangements for disaster response in 1995	14
2.3 Chronicling the response, 1995-8	16
<b>3. MANAGING THE EMERGENCY: MONTSERRAT, BARBADOS AND LONDON</b>	<b>29</b>
3.1 How the emergency has been managed	29
3.2 DFID management information: records and expenditure	34
3.3 The shifting locus of responsibility	37
3.4 Interdepartmental co-ordination	41
3.5 Assessment of management performance	43

<b>4. RISK MANAGEMENT: SCIENTIFIC MONITORING AND PROTECTING LIFE AND HEALTH</b>	<b>49</b>
4.1 A reactive strategy	49
4.2 Scientific monitoring and disaster preparedness	50
4.3 Scientific monitoring and risk assessment since 1995	52
4.4 Protecting lives: emergency planning and operations	61
4.5 Safeguarding public health	74
<b>5. SOCIAL SECTORS: ACCOMMODATION, SOCIAL ASSISTANCE AND EDUCATION</b>	<b>83</b>
5.1 Issues of standards and expectations	83
5.2 Accommodation: appropriateness and timeliness of HMG's response	84
5.3 Public shelter for displaced people	85
5.4 Emergency housing	88
5.5 The social safety net	95
5.6 Social assistance: appropriateness, impact and efficiency	97
5.7 Education: sustaining a comprehensive, quality system	99
5.8 Education: appropriateness and impact of HMG's response	101
<b>6. EMERGENCY INVESTMENT AND ENGINEERING PROGRAMMES</b>	<b>105</b>
6.1 Selected major activities: issues for assessment	105
6.2 Timing and appropriateness	106
6.3 Costs and cost-effectiveness	111
6.4 Connectedness	113
6.5 Institutions and management	114
<b>7. RESPONDING TO THE ECONOMIC AND FINANCIAL CONSEQUENCES OF THE VOLCANIC EMERGENCY</b>	<b>115</b>
7.1 Economic impacts	115
7.2 Economic development strategies and the volcanic crisis	119
7.3 The private sector	123
7.4 Budgetary assistance	126
7.5 The financial sector	130
7.6 Overall assessment	136

<b>8. LEAVING MONTSERRAT: RELOCATION SCHEMES AND THE ROLE OF HMG</b>	
<b>DEPARTMENTS IN THE UK</b>	<b>141</b>
8.1 Relocating off-island	141
8.2 Off-island arrangements	142
8.3 Support systems in the region	144
8.4 Support systems in the UK	145
8.5 Issues for further assessment	149
<b>9. FINANCIAL ANALYSIS OF HMG'S RESPONSE</b>	<b>151</b>
9.1 HMG sources of assistance	151
9.2 Analysis of assistance	157
9.3 Other external assistance	161
<b>10. A CHRONOLOGY OF THE VOLCANIC EMERGENCY</b>	<b>163</b>
<b>11. REFERENCES</b>	<b>179</b>
<b>List of Maps</b>	
Map 1	Montserrat location map v
Map 2	New and Prehistoric Pyroclastic Deposits of the Soufrière Hills Volcano vi
Map 3	Selected Risk Maps Produced by the MVO vii
Map 4	North Montserrat; emergency and new engineering projects - November 1998 viii
<b>List of Boxes</b>	
Box 4.1	The Role of Scientists in the Information Age 59
Box 4.2	Keeping the Airport Open 60
Box 4.3	Four Second-Hand School Buses 71
Box 7.1	The Soft Mortgage Scheme: a Catalogue of Delays 132

## **List of Tables**

Table 1.1	Shelter Population, May 1996-October 1998	10
Table 5.1	HMG Direct-build Public Housing Construction up to December 1998	90
Table 5.2	Self-Build Materials and Materials Finishing Grant Schemes	91
Table 5.3	Educational Provision in Montserrat, June 1995-September 1998	101
Table 6.1	Selected Emergency Investments Programmes - General Status	106
Table 6.2	Time Taken in Processing Emergency Engineering Projects	109
Table 6.3	Cost Escalation - Immediate Housing and Government Headquarters	111
Table 7.1	Government of Montserrat Expenditure, 1993-98	127
Table 9.1	DFID Bilateral Aid	152
Table 9.2	DFID Expenditure in Support of Montserrat, 1995/96-1998/99	153
Table 9.3	DFID Expenditure in Support of Montserrat by Functional Use, 1995/96-1997/98	160
Table 9.4	Other External Assistance Receipts in Response to the Montserrat Volcanic Crisis, 1995-1998	162

## **List of Figures**

Figure 3.1	Management of HMG's Response to Montserrat's volcanic Emergency	30
Figure 3.2	Montserrat Volcanic Crisis: Management Structure in June/July 1997 and October 1998	33
Figure 6.1	Summary of HMG Responses (Engineering) - Selected Investments	108
Figure 9.1	DFID Bilateral Assistance to Caribbean Overseas Territories, 1988/9-1996/7	154
Figure 9.2	Quarterly DFID Expenditure in Montserrat, 1993/94-1998/99	154
Figure 9.3	DFID Expenditure in Montserrat by Functional Use, 1995/96-1997/98	160

### PREFACE

Each year the Department for International Development (DFID) commissions a number of ex post evaluation studies. The purpose of the DFID's evaluation programme is to examine rigorously the implementation and impact of selected past projects and to generate the lessons learned from them so that these can be applied to current and future projects.

The DFID'S Evaluation Department is independent of DFID's spending divisions and reports directly to the Principal Finance Officer.

Evaluation teams consist of an appropriate blend of specialist skills and are normally (but not in this case) made up of a mixture of in-house staff, fully conversant with DFID's procedures, and independent external consultants who bring a fresh perspective to the subject-matter. Particulars of the seven team members are listed in the study's Foreword.

The evaluation involved the following stages:-

- initial desk study of all relevant papers;
- consultations with individuals and organisations concerned with the project, including field missions to collect data and interview those involved;
- preparation of a draft report which was circulated in June 1999 to HMG Departments involved in the response and the Government of Montserrat;
- submission of the draft report to DFID's Portfolio Review Committee, to note the main conclusions and lessons to be learned.

This process is designed to ensure the production of a high quality report and Summary sheet (EVSUM) which draws out all the lessons from the study on the basis of the draft report.

**Evaluation Department**





## FOREWORD

The Evaluation Study of HMG's Response to the Montserrat Volcanic Emergency is funded by the Evaluation Department of the Department for International Development and undertaken in accordance with the Terms of Reference circulated to involved Government Departments, the Government of Montserrat and the House of Commons Select Committee for International Development. The final Terms of Reference for the whole study are attached (Appendix A).

This independent evaluation was undertaken by the Overseas Development Institute in London, and began on 27 September 1998. The study involved a 7 person team whose responsibilities have been broadly as follows. Edward Clay (Team Leader) drafted the report with assistance throughout from Nita Pillai and contributions by Charlotte Benson on economic and financial aspects. Background research and initial drafting on specific aspects of the emergency and HMG's response involved: Christine Barrow - accommodation and education; Charlotte Benson - economics and aid expenditure; Edward Clay - history of the emergency and management; Jim Dempster - civil engineering, cartography and graphics; Peter Kokelaar - volcanology; Nita Pillai - chronology, food vouchers and the role of home departments; and John Seaman - health. A short biographical note on the team members is given in Appendix D.

The report is based on a review of official and other relevant documentation in London and Montserrat, interviews with British officials in Montserrat and the UK, Government of Montserrat, some staff and representatives of civil society institutions concerned with the island as well as other professional persons who have been involved with Montserrat. A selective list of those contacted for the study is attached as Appendix C (not everyone contacted by the team in group discussions was separately identified). The evaluation has largely focused on the period up to the team's visit to Montserrat in November 1998. However, later developments in a few key areas are noted. In particular, the appearance of a new lava dome in November 1999 just as the report was being finalised has underlined once again the uncertain future course of the continuing eruption. However, the implications of this development necessarily fall outside the scope of this enquiry. A Draft Report was circulated in June 1999 to HMG departments involved in the response and to the Government of Montserrat. The Final Report has taken account of comments received.

The team would like especially to acknowledge the co-operation of many people in Montserrat during two fact finding visits in October and early November 1998, and a third visit in September 1999 for reviewing the Draft Report, as well as all those contacted in the UK. Alice Baker edited the Final Report; the editorial assistance of Margaret Cornell and Mavis Clay and the secretarial support of Terry Henson are also gratefully acknowledged. Bernard Jordan and Doreen Amphlett, DFID's editing team for its series of evaluation reports, also provided invaluable support. Finally, the team would like to acknowledge with sadness all the support and advice which they received from the late Christopher Raleigh as Head of DFID's Evaluation Department before his untimely death in November 1999.

**Edward Clay**  
**Overseas Development Institute**  
**December 1999**



**LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS & ACRONYMS**

AMO	Aid Management Office
APS	Assisted Passage Scheme
ARVRS	Assisted Regional Voluntary Relocation Scheme
BDDC	British Development Division in the Caribbean
BGS(I)	British Geological Survey (International)
BoM	Bank of Montserrat
BVI	British Virgin Islands
CARICOM	Caribbean Community
CDB	Caribbean Development Bank
CDERA	Caribbean Disaster and Emergency Relief Agency
CHAD	Conflict and Humanitarian Affairs Department
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CPP	Country Policy Plan
CXC	Caribbean Examination Council
DETR	Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions
DfEE	Department for Education and Employment
DFID	Department for International Development
DHSS	Department of Health and Social Security
DoH	Department of Health
DTRS	Dependent Territories Regional Secretariat
DU	Development Unit
EC\$	Eastern Caribbean Dollars
ECCB	Eastern Caribbean Central Bank
ECHO	European Union (formerly Community) Humanitarian Office
ED	Emergency Department
EDF	European Development Fund
EIB	European Investment Bank
ELMT	Emergency Logistics Management Team
EMAD	Emergency Aid Department

EOC	Emergency Operations Centre
EPD	Emergency Planning Division
ERC	Emergency Relief Coordinator
ESU	Emergency Supplies Unit
EU	European Union
ExCo	Executive Council
FCO	Foreign and Commonwealth Office
FVO	Food Voucher Office
FVS	Food Voucher Scheme
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GGF	Good Governance Fund
GHQ	Government Headquarters
GoM	Government of Montserrat
HEO	Higher Executive Officer
HMG	Her Majesty=s Government
IDC	House of Commons Select Committee on International Development
IND	Immigration and Nationalities Directorate
LegCo	Legislative Council
LSE	London School of Economics
MAG	Montserrat Action Group
MATE	Ministry of Agriculture, Transport and Environment
MBS	Montserrat Building Society
MDF	Montserrat Defence Force
MoD	Ministry of Defence
MoE	Ministry of Education
MOPPA	Montserrat Overseas Peoples Progressive Alliance
MU	Montserrat Unit
MVEG	Montserrat Volcanic Executive Group
MVO	Montserrat Volcano Observatory
MVSG	Montserrat Volcanic Support Group
NDF	National Development Foundation

NERC	Natural Environment Research Council
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NIP	National Indicative Programme
ODA	Overseas Development Administration
ODI	Overseas Development Institute
OFDA	US Office of Foreign Disaster Assistance
OST	Office of Science and Technology
OT	Overseas Territory
OTD	Overseas Territories Department (FCO)
OTU	Overseas Territories Unit (DFID)
PAHO	Pan American Health Organisation
PTR	Pupil: Teacher Ratio
PUSS	Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State
PS	Private Secretary
PWD	Public Works Department
RAR	Resource Allocation Review
RCSA	Resource Centre Scheme Agreement
REU	Race Equality Unit
RMPPF	Royal Montserrat Police Force
SDP	Sustainable Development Plan
SEO	Senior Executive Officer
SRU	Seismic Research Unit
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USGS	United States Geological Survey
USVI	United States Virgin Islands
UWI	University of the West Indies
VES	Voluntary Evacuation Scheme
WIAD	West Indies and Atlantic Department
WIGS	West Indies Guardship



**Figure 1**  
**Montserrat at the end of 1998 and a chronology of volcanic events and evacuations**

